Photovoice as a Method to Engage Older Adults of Color and of Language Minorities in New Hampshire

Anna M. Adachi-Mejia, PhD
Dartmouth

Semra A. Aytur, PhD
University of New Hampshire
Today’s learning objectives

• We will review methods and results of a photovoice study designed to inform diversity, inclusion, and equity in older adult health initiatives as an example of: Growing Strategic Community Partners to Advance Health Equity
  • This project involves:
    • Older adult participants from Bhutanese, Hispanic/Latino, and Black/African-American communities living in southern New Hampshire
    • Community-engaged research
    • Multi-sectoral collaboration

• What is photovoice and how does it relate to health equity
• Special Considerations for data collection
• Next steps: data analysis, community events, calls to action
• Discussion
Today’s objectives

- Photovoice as a research method
- Special considerations
- Results
- Where do we go from here
Who we are

Anna Adachi-Mejia

Semra Aytur
The Need: Older Adults

• New Hampshire’s population boasts a large proportion of older adults relative to the rest of the country.

• In 2010, New Hampshire’s median age was 41.1 years; only three other states in the country have a higher median age than New Hampshire.

• Based on the 2016 US Census, 16% of New Hampshire residents are age 55-64, and 16% are age 65 or older.
The Need: Racial/ethnic diversity in NH

• Most (94%) of the state’s population is white. However, racial/ethnic diversity in New Hampshire is increasing.

• Minorities represent less than 5% of the population in New Hampshire, yet comprised 50% of the population growth between 2000 and 2010.

• Minority populations are geographically concentrated in the southern regions of the state – mainly in the Concord-Manchester-Nashua corridor.

• About 8% of New Hampshire residents speak a language other than English.

• Each year, about 400 refugees resettle in New Hampshire; from 2009-2014, 3,317 refugees resettled in New Hampshire.

• Refugees come from more than 30 different nations. Most resettle in Manchester, Concord, Nashua, and Laconia.
Figure 1. Population counts of people ages 65 and older, Bhutanese (all ages), Hispanic (all ages), Black (all ages) in New Hampshire. Maps created by the GeoSpatial resource at the Norris Cotton Cancer Center.
Project goals

• Engage communities of color and of language minorities regarding their lived experience of aging in New Hampshire.

• Elicit their perspectives and empower them to share their otherwise invisible stories to others, including providers and programs that serve older adults.

• Inform professionals who work with and/or care for older adults (also referred to as “elders”) on our findings.

• Engage in positive relationships with communities that have historically experienced trauma and mistrust without adding to a negative relationship cycle.
Project goals

• Support and inform the understanding of what can contribute to advancing the health, independence, and dignity of older adults / elders of color and of language minorities directly through the voices and perspectives of the community members themselves.

• Through the technique of photovoice, which puts cameras in the hands of study participants to empower them to describe their point of view, we will engage in a process intended to build trust, engage new people into the conversation about perspectives and experiences of aging in New Hampshire, and communicate the voices of people who have historically been silenced.
Today’s objectives

Photovoice as a research method

Results

Special considerations

Where do we go from here
Photovoice as an Equity Method
What does health equity mean?

- Health equity means we all have the basics to be as healthy as possible.

- However, for many people, prospects for good health are limited by where we live, how much money we make, or discrimination we face.

- Personal responsibility plays a key role in health, but the choices we make depend on the choices we have available to us.

- Across the nation, gaps in health are large, persistent and increasing.

- To achieve health equity, we need to address these barriers and shift values so seeking to be healthy is a part of everything we do.

Inclusion Strategies

- Getting fair treatment from others (nondiscrimination);

- Making products, communications, and the physical environment more usable by as many people as possible (universal design);

- Modifying items, procedures, or systems to enable a person with a disability to use them to the maximum extent possible (reasonable accommodations); and

- Eliminating stigma and stereotypes
Endowment for Health: Ensuring the Health and Dignity of Elders

The Endowment for Health aims to create a culture that supports the physical, mental, social and economic well-being of all people – through every stage of life.

- New Hampshire’s population is, on average, older than most other states.

- As longevity increases, we will see an increase in the average age of the older population.

- As people experience better health into later years of life, the definitions of retirement and healthy aging are changing.

- How and where people age is changing as well.

- People are aging in place at home or are opting to live in community outside of traditional institutional care.

Endowment for Health: Ensuring the Health and Dignity of Elders (2)

- Through the Elder Health Initiative, the Endowment is working collaboratively to create communities in New Hampshire where older adults are offered a wide range of choices to advance health, choice, independence, and dignity.

- The focus is on building a coalition, increasing the knowledge base, growing leadership and community support, and increasing funding and support for policy.
What is Photovoice?

- Research participants use cameras to record and represent their everyday lived experience.

- Use photos to promote critical dialogue about personal and community issues and assets (Wang et al., 2004).

- Allows participants to become recorders and catalysts for social change via communication with policymakers.

“I took this picture of cigarette signs on a gas station next to Pulaski Park. Smoking is bad for you, yet the advertising is big and eye-catching. It’s weird that these ads are so close to a place that is healthy and good.”

Number of publications appearing on PubMed using the search term "photovoice" as of December 6, 2016
Think of photovoice as a method...the same way running a focus group is a method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facilitator does not give their own opinion</th>
<th>Focus groups</th>
<th>Photovoice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants interact with each other</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wide range of ages</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topics vary</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information could be used for informing future intervention</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single meeting</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple meetings over a time period</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How Does Photovoice Relate to Equity?
Integration of Person-Centered and Population-Centered Approach
Theoretical Foundations

- Freirean Empowerment Theory (Freire, 1973; 1994)
- Feminist Theory
- Community-Based Participatory Research (Wang, 1997)
- Emphasis on oppression, objectification, inequality
- Attention to social issues
- Consciousness raising
- Community advocacy/policy change
Photovoice: A Participatory Action Research (PAR) Approach

- An approach to research that brings together researchers and community members to:
  - Identify problems that the community faces
  - Empower community members to research and create solutions to those problems
  - Eliminate disparities
  - Collaboratively improve conditions in the community
Types of Visual Methods

- Photovoice
- Photo Elicitation
- Photo-novella
- Film Elicitation
- Photo-GIS

From Where I Sit

Our community through the eyes of people with spinal cord injury
Photovoice as a Method to Engage Older Adults of Color and of Language Minorities in NH

- Demographics of NH are changing rapidly
- Need to understand the lived experience of older adults of color/language minorities - from their own perspective
- Compare themes within and across groups
- Solutions-oriented approach: What can We Do?
Challenges Associated with Photovoice and Visual Research Methods

- Logistics: Time, staff, expertise, travel, equipment, cost
- Ethics; IRB
- Research design
- Research approach (differences in disciplinary traditions)
- Respondent fatigue, withdrawal
- Translation and Interpretation
- Sustaining a policy-relevant dialogue
Data Analysis

- Thematic coding of photos, captions, focus group & interview transcripts
- Template Method\(^1\)
- Iterative process
- NVivo software-used to assist with coding

Next Steps: What Can We Do?

The SHOWeD Method:

- (1) what do you See here?
- (2) what is really Happening here?
- (3) how does this relate to Our lives?
- (4) why does this situation or condition exist?
- (5) what can we Do about it?

Anna’s Method:

- What is the photograph of?
- Where was the photograph taken?
- Why did you take the photograph?
- What do you want us to know about the photograph?

Next Steps: What we can do at different levels of the Socio-Ecological Model
RWJF “Culture of Health” Action framework

- Our approach aligns with the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation’s “Culture of Health” vision and framework for improving health, equity and well-being in America.

- Recognizes that our health is greatly influenced by complex factors such as where we live, and the strength of our families and communities.

RWJF “Culture of Health” Action framework (2)

Three core elements:

- **Action Areas**: high-level objectives which can improve population health, well-being and equity;

- **Drivers**: activities or systemic factors that are critical to achieving better health; and,

- **Measures**: specific social, economic and policy data points that can help track progress over time.
Action Areas

- **Making Health a Shared Value** - How can individuals, families, and communities work to achieve and maintain health?

- **Fostering Cross-Sector Collaboration** - How can we encourage cooperation across all sectors?

- **Creating Healthier, More Equitable Communities** - How can we develop safe environments that nurture children, support aging adults, and offer equitable access to healthy choices?

- **Strengthening Integration of Health Services and Systems** - How can health care providers work with institutional partners to address the realities of patients' lives?
Living with Discrimination Can Take a Toll on Health

- Research demonstrates that any type of stress can impact health, but none may be quite as toxic as the tension and anxiety people experience when they fear that they will be discriminated against.

- Sociologists have a different way of looking at how people respond to discrimination on a personal level and what it's like to live in a country where the media portrays certain groups in a certain way.

- For example, the Chicago Adult Community Health Study measured the possible health effects of remaining hypervigilant about encountering racism when engaging in simple, everyday activities.
Discrimination Can Make You Sick

The effects are particularly acute for Black Americans, the group most likely to have hypertension and most likely to be hypervigilant about discrimination. Hypertension and insomnia both contribute to heart disease risk.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Blacks</th>
<th>Whites</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do you prepare for possible insults before leaving home at least once a week?</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you feel you have to be careful about your appearance to avoid harassment?</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you try to avoid certain social situations and places?</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At the highest levels of hypervigilance:

- 55% of Black adults have hypertension
- 20% of White adults have hypertension

- 15% Black adults reported more hypervigilance-related sleep problems than White adults.

---


DISCRIMINATION CAN MAKE YOU SICK

Staying on guard (hypervigilance) about encountering discrimination is terrible for your health. A new study is the first to show that hypervigilance about racism—a major source of stress—is linked to hypertension (high blood pressure) and may keep people up at night,** reports RWJF Health & Society Scholars program alumna Margaret Hicken, PhD.

The effects are particularly acute for Black Americans, the group most likely to have hypertension and most likely to be hypervigilant about discrimination. Hypertension and insomnia both contribute to heart disease risk.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Blacks</th>
<th>Whites</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do you prepare for possible insults before leaving home at least once a week?</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Blacks | Whites
---|---
Do you prepare for possible insults before leaving home at least once a week? | 15% | 3%
Do you feel you have to be careful about your appearance to avoid harassment? | 16% | 5%
Do you try to avoid certain social situations and places? | 30% | 8%
At the highest levels of hypervigilance:

- 55% of Black adults have hypertension
- 20% of White adults have hypertension
- 15% Black adults reported more hypervigilance-related sleep problems than White adults.


Robert Wood Johnson Foundation
Photovoice

• A tool to facilitate participant empowerment
• A tool to frame potential policy solutions
• Supports sharing experiences and perspectives
• Enables community members to advocate for change for themselves and for their community
• A tool to foster community linkages and to support a succession plan for future community-based health promotion programs
Key points

• Photovoice gives people a voice.
  • They can tell their story.
  • They can experience empowerment.

• It is a tool for community engagement.

• It is a tool with the potential to help make policies and environmental changes systems more equitable.

• People of all ages can participate.
Today’s objectives

Photovoice as a research method

Special considerations

Results

Where do we go from here
# The power of community partners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trust</th>
<th>Sense of timing</th>
<th>Bridge to making things happen</th>
<th>Recruitment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Helps to break the ice</td>
<td>• They will tell you what works</td>
<td>• Opening doors</td>
<td>• Early adopters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Also check on the timing with actual participants</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Late adopters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The friends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>bring friends</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Trust helps to break the ice.
- Sense of timing tells you what works and also checks on the timing with actual participants.
- Bridge to making things happen opens doors.
- Recruitment includes early adopters, late adopters, and friends bringing friends.
Working with interpreters

**Written text**
- Offer them written text with technical words spelled out

**Time**
- Two-hour minimum
- Evenings, weekends
- Always takes longer than you think

**Language issues**
- Simultaneous versus sentence by sentence
- Word for word versus offering the gist of the idea

**Variation in dialect**
- Same words mean different things
- Different words mean same thing
How do you involve community members in research? Some special considerations...

• Common challenges that people talk about
  • Access
  • Recruitment
  • Trust

• Other issues that might be invisible
  • Misalignment with expectations, perspectives, viewpoints
  • Misfires between the needs of individuals and of different organizations

• Assumptions that people make
  • About you
  • About your institution
  • About the resources you have or don’t have
  • About what is possible
Research considerations

- **Forms**
  - Cultural clash of expectations
  - Trust

- **Language**
  - Signing forms
  - Writing

- **Technology**
  - Using a camera

- **Time**
  - Takes longer than you think
The budget

• Processing
• Timing
• Expectations
• Interpreters
• Printing
• Participation
• Requirements
Special considerations for data collection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The facilitator</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Food</th>
<th>Room setup</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Creates a safe space for people to talk</td>
<td>• Evenings, weekends</td>
<td>• Cultural sensitivity</td>
<td>• Noise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is there to hear others talk</td>
<td>• Always takes longer than</td>
<td>• Striking the balance between individual</td>
<td>• Who has the key</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Clothing considerations</td>
<td>you think</td>
<td>versus organizational expectations</td>
<td>• Sit in a circle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Varies widely</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Food

• Not surprisingly, people have strong opinions about what they want to eat
• Taking into consideration cultural norms, expectations, and getting people to feel comfortable
• Funder requirements
• Institution requirements
• Striking a balance

• Big paper bags with rope handles were very popular!
The facilitator

• Meet people where they are at. No right or wrong answers.

• Be comfortable with uncertainty – go with the flow. Be ready for not knowing what will happen.
  • Analogy to the stage – sometimes you have to improvise.

• Dress comfortably. Not necessarily a business suit.
  • Analogy to the stage – the tech crew wears black so as to not draw attention to themselves. You are not literally going to wear all black to hide from the light but your goal is to blend in while being true to yourself.

• More like coaching than like consulting. You are not solving people’s problems. You empowering people to find the answers for themselves.

• Believe in people. They are capable.
Protect your facilitator

• Your facilitator needs to put everyone at ease, to understand all of the different opinions and considerations, and to make the connections seem seamless and invisible
  • Ranging from logistics, ordering food, and managing humans
  • Ending on time
  • People arrive early/late, enroll late
  • Clean recordings
  • Food issues
  • Juggling what is happening in the room with everyone’s needs
  • Keeping track of what happened (methods), who said what, etc.
  • Sometimes not possible to get additional help because the hours are unpredictable, inconsistent, and/or you can’t afford it

• Your facilitator also has to navigate possible strong opinions, assumptions, negativity, defensiveness, dismissiveness from outsiders, higher-ups, other partners...
Every group is different

• Striking the balance between consistent methods and responding to people’s needs in the moment
Today’s objectives

Photovoice as a research method

Special considerations

Results

Where do we go from here
Recruitment

Target
- 3 sites
- 30 people

Actual
- 4 sites
- 48 people
Multiple key partnerships across a wide range of organizations involved in aging, equity, community-based participatory research, and community building with a shared goal of promoting the health, independence, and dignity of older adults.
Thank you!

Advisory Board Members:
Anna Adachi-Mejia (Principal Investigator / Project lead; Dartmouth)
Nathalie Ahyi (Advisor; New Hampshire Health and Equity Partnership)
Semra Aytur (Faculty partner; University of New Hampshire)
Bobbie Bagley (Community partner lead; New Fellowship Baptist Church)
Margarita Fernandez-Letkowski (Community partner lead and Spanish interpreter; St. Anne – St. Augustin Parish)
Kelly Laflamme (Funding partner; Endowment for Health)
Melina Hill Walker (Funding partner; Endowment for Health)
Stephanie Kelly (Research Assistant; Dartmouth)
Bhagirath Khatiwada (Community partner lead; Bhutanese Community of New Hampshire)
Laurie Nsiah-Jefferson (Faculty partner; Brandeis University)
Jennifer Rabalais (Advisor; Alliance for Healthy Aging)
Jenna Schiffelbein (Community communication lead; Dartmouth)

Additional thanks to:
“I can’t do this”

“But my opinion doesn’t matter”
Process

Recruitment → Informed Consent → Group meetings

Photos → Logbooks → Surveys → Group discussion
Part 1. Take as many photos as you wish. Take photos of places and things. Please do not take photos of people.

Take photographs of:
1. When you think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire, what are things that are going well for you?
2. When you think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire, what are things that you would like help with as you think about aging?
3. When you think about aging, what does the word choice mean to you?
4. When you think about aging, what does the word independence mean to you?
5. When you think about aging, what does the word dignity mean to you?
6. When you think about aging, are there any other words that come to mind that you would like to share with us? If so, please describe it in your own words.

Part 2. Telling us about your photos.
For each photograph, please write about:
What is the photograph of?
Where was the photograph taken?
Why did you take the photograph?
What do you want us to know about the photograph?
Each individual took a series of photos...
Here is an example from one individual
Another individual...
Another individual...
A mi me gusta aprender. De todo. Aprender a tejer. A mi me gustaría mucho aprender el violín pero nunca pude. No tuve la oportunidad.

I like to learn. Of everything. Learn to knit. I would really like to learn the violin but I never could. I did not have the chance.

Las flores son hermosísimas. Hermosas. Nuestras almas son más hermosas que las flores. La alegría de Dios.

The flowers are beautiful. Beautiful. Our souls are more beautiful than flowers. The joy of God.
It is nature created by God.
In God's creation everything is perfect. Nature, trees.

That is the bathroom that I use. It is important because we use it. It is important to the people who go to that place.

That's my kitchen. I like it because it is in my house where I live alone.
Each person described their favorite photo(s)...

The kitchen is important for me to do activities and to receive people. I enjoy being in the kitchen.

When I go to bed I read Psalm 91. My daughter gave it to me and it is in my room. When I feel afraid, I read that part of Psalm 91 and then I am no longer afraid.
What is important to you and why?

What would you like help with?

Wish list
Welcome to our photovoice gallery!

Photovoice is a method that invites study participants to share their individual point of view through photography and words.

On these posters, you will see examples of photographs and quotes from older adult participants from communities living in Southern New Hampshire.

We asked:

_Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire..._

What are things that are going well for you?
What are things that you would like help with as you think about aging?
What do the words choice, dignity, and independence mean to you?

For this project, we developed partnerships with a variety of organizations with a shared goal of promoting the health, independence, and dignity of older adults. Please note that the themes/photos/quotes displayed here are examples only; they may or may not reflect the opinions of an entire community. We hope that these examples help spark conversations and serve as a way for sharing ideas to inform next steps.
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that you would like help with as you age?

Building Community

“The kitchen…it's about family for me...You know. It's the children, the grandchildren, the husbands, it's everybody, the wholeness. It's the brothers, it's the fathers, mother. That's always the gathering place, and even now, when you talk about doing different programs, we always talk about...have a meal, you'll get the people there, you know? [laughs].”

“I have my grandchildren at home. And I spend time with them, so everything is good, everything is good.”

“I'm grateful for the kids; that I affected their lives. There's a lot of kids out here people might not know about. That I affected their lives...I had a kid down here he pointed me out, 'Oh man, that's my coach.' And he was at his job and he was telling people.”
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that you would like help with as you age?

Planning for Purpose in Older Life

“I find that I'm relaxed when I'm quilting, it keeps my mind sharp because I get involved in math, dexterity with your hands, your eyesight.”

“I want to help the future for most things that I do. I want things to be better for our youth.”

“It’s a stool that I made out of bamboo. It takes around three days to make.”

“The drums, that's a workout. Being the drummer...I love doing it, it's my passion. Everything I do I take pride in.”

“I do crafts with recycling items like paper, magazines, things like that. No plastic.”
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that are going well for you?

Spirituality and Religion

“This is my temple.”

“Religion is a comfort to me in times of trouble as well as strength when I feel weak.”

“I took a picture of the cross because I love crosses. And it has lots of bright colors.”
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire.
What are things that are going well for you?

Parks, Paths, and Benches

“The greenery is important so people can go to breathe pure air, to walk.”

“Benches are important to the park. Especially when you get old...
You can’t walk as much...I like walking.”
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that are going well for you?

Gardening

“I used to plant a lot of flowers in Bhutan when I was young.”

“I planted vegetables here.”

“We make a garland from the flowers for the festival.”

“We need flowers every morning to worship, to offer to our temples. It's important to us.”

“I grow beans, corn, mustard leaf.”

“We can make pickles from sunflower seeds.”
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that are going well for you?

Physical Activity

“To feel young at heart and to feel energetic, we need exercise, moving our bodies. I love to run, bike, hike, swim, and doing aerobic exercises...Exercising is like a drug that you can’t live without. It keeps you young and strong. It also slows down the aging process.”

“I am grateful for all the opportunities basketball has provided for me to serve young people over the years...I am grateful for the way they look up to me...I love that even at my advanced age I can still compete with and beat young men at playing the game I have played so long. I love to look in their eyes and see the surprised look on their faces when they realize that the old short guy they dismissed is more than they thought, that not only can I compete with them but that I am actually an opponent they cannot overcome, and there is nothing they can do.”
Hispanic/Latino Community Member View

Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that you would like help with as you age?

I feel welcomed when you give me a role

“This is the place where I learned to speak English. The people were welcoming. They have programs for immigrants. The teacher who was helping her was a very nice person....It was a welcoming place...A welcoming place is a place where somebody familiar welcomes you, like everybody is a family...I was a volunteer in that school too...they gave to me, and I gave back to them.”

“I couldn't go out...I was alone in the house...These days, I stay in the house, watch the news and the computer, so I keep busy. I do some research about Alzheimer's, my mother has Alzheimer's, so every day I get emails about her, about Alzheimer's. So I read them, and along the day I do crafts.”
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that you would like help with as you age?

Read to me in Nepali

“Before I go to bed, I used to read this.”

“I do not read but if others could get a chance to read to me that would be great. Only my son can read this. Other small kids they do not read Nepali.”
Think about your experience of aging in New Hampshire. What are things that you would like help with as you age?

Accessible Public Transportation

**Problem: Bus Stops are not visibly marked; no shelter**

“All Bus Stops should be painted on the curb a long solid line (yellow + white) at least 30 ft. so that it can be recognized as a bus stop from a distance. Bus number with arrival time would be helpful to see for those who need the service but are not familiar with the service.”

“Make the signs bigger and have a shelter with heated seats.”

**Problem: Barriers to using Paratransit**

“You have to call every two weeks to make sure that you called in as to wanting them to pick you up. If you don’t...they’re saying they won’t pick you up anymore.”

“You have to be in their path, they don’t come to your back door and stuff like that...Since that rain, it was colder...my grandson is out there waiting for the bus, saying, ‘Here comes the bus, here comes the bus.’”

**Problem: Bus Lanes are not visibly marked; confusing flow**

“Each bus parking lane should be posted and marked. Post the bus time schedule. Make marking on the curb so you can recognize it.”

“The way you would normally go in there, you can’t because the parking garage is right there too. You would think you could just pull right in that way, but you can’t because of the way they have the buses going. It’s messed up, it’s backwards.”
**Our wish list**

- **“Viejo-tecas”** (dance parties for older adults) starting at 5pm
- Computer training
  - Be involved in child-rearing as grandparents or as helpers to others
    - Helping children 3+ years old
    - Working on behavior with children, such as:
      - Saying no, explaining why with consequences
      - “Eating right gives a healthy body and healthy mind”

- Spanish-speaking senior center
  - Field trips
  - Place to meet to do activities
  - Group activities
  - BINGO in Spanish
  - Share craft skills with others

- In the park:
  - Benches
  - Water
  - Bathrooms
  - Shade
  - Light
  - Swimming pool
  - Food to purchase
  - Rent bicycles

- Welcoming place to learn English
  - Familiar person, makes you feel welcome and useful (give you a role), they show that they want you there

- Public Transportation: Bus

- Sauna

- Ginger tea with cookies

- Community garden
Our wish list

**Bhutanese Community Member Views**

**A big temple**
- "We need a big temple where we can pray"..."Having a temple - that would be like sending a God"
- Transportation to the temple
- Festivals are very important – having festivals to worship, pray, and make offerings to many gods and goddesses
- Statues of Lakshmi and Narayan
- It would be a place for other activities, such as having social interaction and offering language classes for youth

**Access to audio**
- Religious audio discs from Bhutan
- Hear news in Nepali and English
- Listen to stories of God
- Audio recording of the book of prayer

**Access to food purchases in the presence of a Nepali interpreter**
- At the American market: have a Nepali interpreter; offer food like dal and curry that we can purchase
- Bring American food to the Nepali market – for example, offer varieties of bananas and apples like they have at Market Basket – we want more selection and choice of American food at the Nepali market

**Social interaction**

**Work release for Hindu festivals**
- Being allowed to take time off from work to celebrate festivals
Black/African-American Community Member Views

Our wish list

**Our church**
- Church bus
- All are welcome here – different groups can meet here, the community can meet here
- We need more missionaries
- Our basement needs another exit – it only has one and we need two – then we can use that space and use it to serve the community
- Kitchen

**Services for young people**
- Positive programs
- Free basketball

**Meeting place for older adults**
- A safe haven for older adults
- Recreation/activity, get out and do something
- Seniors coming together and sharing

**Coming together - avoid loneliness**

**Happiness: can we all be happy and get along**

**Social programs instead of tax breaks**
- Have the government make things better for the average person
- Let’s protect the people we don’t know

**Caregiver support and protection**
- Policy for time off
- No risk of losing job if taking care of parent
- Medical benefits for family members
- Information for caregivers
- Helpers for caregivers

**Visit me at my home**
- When you don’t come to my house I feel offended – “I do go to their homes, but not one of them has been to mine. Why is that? I don’t want to go out of my house just to have a cup of coffee when I have a Keurig right there. To say, ‘Meet me at a coffee shop’...to me, that’s an insult.”
- I want people to stop by when I am homebound

**Don’t assume things about me or about others**
- “Don’t assume that a person is poor...hungry...ignorant...going to rob or steal from you...Don’t assume anything, because you don’t know that person...”
Today’s objectives

Photovoice as a research method

Special considerations

Results

Where do we go from here
What is next

- Data analysis
- Community events
- Calls to action
- Policy change
I took this picture because I think it reflects a reality for older farmers that is only going to get worse if the “baby boom” generation keeps farming.

Camera_028: So that was my first picture with my camera.
Interviewer: Alright.
Camera_028: With my camera you know um...
Interviewer: Is there anything you want us to know about that?
Camera_028: About um well I probably wouldn’t be where I am today if it wasn’t for here.
Interviewer: Can you explain...
Camera_028: And then and then I mean the whole thing about this is what? Aging in New Hampshire right?
Interviewer: Yeah.
Camera_028: So I mean a long way with that I mean I think I’ve put quite a few years in here, a few decades here, aging in New Hampshire and growing church has a lot to do with it.
Interviewer: Yeah.
Camera_028: So put this first foremost with everything that’s going on with me, my aging, my health, I give it all to here, to God.
Analysis is an evolving process

Initial impressions → Share → Receive feedback → Analyze the data

Share → Receive feedback → Analyze → Share
Where do we go from here

- Making connections
- Building trust
- Collecting the data
- Analyzing the data
- Sharing the results
Discussion

What will you do next?
Today’s objectives

- Photovoice as a research method
- Special considerations
- Results
- Where do we go from here
Thank you!

Advisory Board Members:
Anna Adachi-Mejia (Principal Investigator / Project lead; Dartmouth)
Nathalie Ahyi (Advisor; New Hampshire Health and Equity Partnership)
Semra Aytur (Faculty partner; University of New Hampshire)
Bobbie Bagley (Community partner lead; New Fellowship Baptist Church)
Margarita Fernandez-Letkowski (Community partner lead and Spanish interpreter; St. Anne – St. Augustin Parish)
Kelly Laflamme (Funding partner; Endowment for Health)
Melina Hill Walker (Funding partner; Endowment for Health)
Stephanie Kelly (Research Assistant; Dartmouth)
Bhagirath Khatiwada (Community partner lead; Bhutanese Community of New Hampshire)
Laurie Nsiah-Jefferson (Faculty partner; Brandeis University)
Jennifer Rabalais (Advisor; Alliance for Healthy Aging)
Jenna Schiffelbein (Community communication lead; Dartmouth)

Additional thanks to:
Our contact information

anna.m.adachi-mejia@dartmouth.edu

Semra.Aytur@unh.edu
References (1)


References (2)


References (3)


References (4)


